Does viewing movies with subtitles count as reading?
Ronnie Davey and Faye Parkhill

Children spend more time with moving images than they do with school work, and through this they acquire an enormous amount of knowledge and experience which some teachers are learning to access and develop (BFI education, 2006). Whilst the use of visual media such as film, television and DVDs has grown in primary schools, the presence of the subtitle facility on most recently released films creates new possibilities for reading advancement and engagement for use in school literacy programmes. The presence and engaging nature of visual and multimodal texts and media for contemporary students is widely reported (e.g. Harrison Group, 2010; King, 2002; Mills, 2009).

Such realisations were the catalyst for the initial development of the Audio Visual Achievement in Literacy (AVAII) programme in the United States. AVAII had its genesis when science educator, the late Dr Alice Killacky, discovered that many of her high school students did not have the reading skills in English to engage successfully in the study of science. She observed, however, their interest in, and deep comprehension of, visual media in science. This realization motivated her to develop a programme that she hoped would engage her students in highly focused reading by giving them opportunity to watch popular movies and simultaneously read the English subtitles of those movies. In an unpublished study of 387 students in their first year of high school, Killacky found that below average readers increased their reading ages by an average of 2.16 years. Similarly, a pilot study that Killacky undertook in New Zealand indicated that the greatest gains in reading literacy occurred for low-progress readers and boys from ethnic minorities (Parkhill & Johnson, 2009).

Since her death, AVAII has been picked up and developed considerably by a specialist in literacy in Christchurch, New Zealand. It includes a teacher's guide, the six-eighth week programme guide and the appropriate DVD and optional Professional Development from the developer. Its aim is to target schools concerned about their level of reading achievement.

The AVAII programme is based on the hypothesis that using popular movies with subtitles not only enhances students' reading skills but has high levels of engagement and also motivates students to read. Alvermann (2002) argues that the level of student engagement is a key mediating factor in student achievement in literacy. Guthrie et al. (2013) suggest that "Measures of behavioral engagement, including self-reported effort (Skinner, Kindermann, & Furrer, 2009), amount of time spent (Guthrie, Wigfield, Metsala, & Cox, 1999) and observed concentration in reading tasks (Jang, 2008), have all correlated with reading achievement." (p.10). Still others have argued that providing relevant links between students' lives and reading instruction resulted in higher volumes of reading engagement and achievement through enabling students to make connections and develop their understanding and meanings further (Latu, 2009; McNaughton & Latu, 2009).

Delivered as a six to eight-week unit, AVAII includes one hour of focused reading per day along with a variety of other activities which students carry out either individually or in pairs, groups and teams. All activities are designed to target the key skills of reading comprehension, reading fluency, vocabulary exploration and visualisation. Each of the activities briefly described in Table 1 requires collaboration and emphasizes those participatory approaches necessary to support and consolidate learning.

Most research on the use of subtitles has been in relation to second language learners (see, for example, King, 2002; Koolstra & Beentjes, 1999) or hearing impaired (Jelinek-Lewis & Jackson, 2001). The common term used where the same language features for both the audio and subtitle is "Same Language Subtitling (SLS)." Kothari, Pandey & Chudgar (2004) demonstrated subtitles can be used equally effectively with hearing students through using same-language subtitles in programmes on television in India. These researchers found that exposure to SLS educational songs improved decoding ability in formal school settings. However, it was outside of the school context, where the watching of television with song subtitles was found to be more than double the percentage of viewers who became good readers, at the same time as halving the percentage of those who remained illiterate.

For struggling or beginning readers, reading speed, word knowledge, decoding, vocabulary acquisition, word recognition, reading comprehension and oral reading rates can all be enhanced through SLS. Lineberger, Piotrowski, and Greenwood (2010) also argue that the use of onscreen print in the form of captions is a meaningful and engaging context to extend word knowledge and comprehension, particularly for those students who are slow to develop and use the alphabetic principle or those who experience difficulty transferring comprehension skills from spoken to written language. In a study of 76 children who had just completed second grade, Lineberger et al. reported that beginning readers recognize more words and read faster and also allowed for a strong focus on central story elements when they viewed television with captions. A longitudinal study by Koskinen, Bowen, Garnbrill, Jensema, and Kane (1997) also showed that those children who viewed television with captions, scored significantly higher on both word knowledge and comprehension than those who viewed without.

Extending reading mileage, another key intended outcome of subtitle usage, appears to encourage the possibility of more students entering what Stanovich and Cunningham (1993) call the positive feedback loop, where the more they read, the wider their vocabulary, and the wider their vocabulary, the greater their comprehension and therefore likely enjoyment of reading. This strong link
NEW ZEALAND LITERACY ASSOCIATION

Table 1. AVAILL activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Surprise subtitles:</td>
<td>Encouraging rapid reading through chunking of text. When a DVD is stopped the image and subtitles are not visible. For this activity, the movie is stopped eight times and the students write down the last subtitle that they have read. As the spoken text can be slightly different from the subtitles, just listening to the movie is insufficient. This activity helps to train the students to read subtitles while watching the movie and also encourages rapid reading and fluency as they must keep up with the pace of the movie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next word hunt:</td>
<td>Focused vocabulary teaching and searching for certain words. The students are asked to write down all of the words that follow a common word (e.g., we) for 25 minutes of the movie.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Take a dictionary to the movies:</td>
<td>Extending word meanings. The movie is paused on a pre-planned subtitle containing a challenging word. Students work in teams with a dictionary to record the meaning in context within a competitive time frame.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fostering fluency:</td>
<td>Providing an oral/written link and reading with phrasing and fluency. The teacher reads an extract near the end of the novel in robotic fashion. The students then read the same passage with a buddy with phrasing and fluency. This provides the link between the film and the novel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read it - see it:</td>
<td>Teaching visualisation to extend comprehension and recall. Similar to Picture students are asked to recreate/recall a scene in visual images from audio-only input.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A movie's worth a hundred words:</td>
<td>Building personal vocabulary knowledge by using contextual support from the movie. In a team activity, students discuss with group members the meanings of challenging words. These are then shared with the class. A vocabulary chart is developed which is used to study for a quiz at the end of the activity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LITERACY FORUM N.Z.

between the amount read and reading development, known widely as ‘the Matthew effect’ is much reported in the literature (Stanovich, 1986).

However, practice on its own proves insufficient to improve reading, explicit teaching, modelling and guided practice are also required. In a single study review of SLS using a kanoke-style experimental intervention with explicit targeted cloze activities (McCall & Craig, 2009), 198 Hawaiian secondary school students made at least a two-year gain in comprehension and this was sustained in subsequent years.

Over the last six years we have had the opportunity to research the implementation in a number of contexts including:

1. A pilot study with 240 Years 5 and 6 students in five New Zealand schools with low socio-economic rating (Parkhill & Johnson, 2009).
2. An experimental study with 323 Year 7 and 8 students in six New Zealand schools, including sustainability data (Parkhill, Johnson, & Bates, 2011).
3. A Years 9 and 10 study with 189 low literacy achievers in five New Zealand secondary schools (Parkhill & Davey, 2012).
4. A study in Queensland with 98 Year 6 and 7 students (Davey & Parkhill, 2012).
5. A study in five high poverty schools in New Zealand comprising Years 5 and 6 students from predominately Maori (65%) and Pasifika (15%) backgrounds that included sustainability of progress data (Davey and Parkhill, 2014).
6. A whole school intervention of Years 7 and 8 students in a large multicultural intermediate school (approximately 800 students) conducted over two years (report nearing completion).

In all of these studies, the Progressive Achievement Test (PAT) standardised test of reading comprehension and vocabulary (Darr, McDowell, Ferral, Twist, & Watson, 2008) was used to measure progress. Tests One to Seven were administered in accordance with the different age groups. A different form of the test for each level was used for the pre-test, post-test and sustainability assessment. PAT tests are developed and standardised for New Zealand schools, and so allow teachers to determine the level of achievement of their students relative to the achievement of students in the same level in Years 4 to 10.

Qualitative data were also analysed from a range of focus group and individual interviews with both students and teachers separately. The quantitative data explored numerical trends in achievement in vocabulary acquisition and reading comprehension whereas the qualitative data gathered participating students’ personal responses to the programme.

The data in all of the studies showed remarkably similar trends, despite the different age groups, school SES (socio-economic status) levels and geographical location. The results over all the studies indicated that the AVAILL programme has had a significant impact, particularly for Maori and Pasifika and low progress students. Analysis showed that statistically significant gains were recorded for both comprehension and vocabulary across all studies. Results indicated improved mean and scale score averages well beyond those expected over six to eight weeks of schooling.
I’ve learnt that I have to read a lot more and to go over words carefully as most words have more than one meaning.

Teachers were also uniformly enthusiastic about the programme and its impact on student motivation and interest.

‘We all loved it doing it and I’m not looking forward to going back to normal programme.

‘I’ve noticed a huge increase in their vocabulary. I have five children who are the lowest of Year five and I’ve noticed this increase has been amazing for those children. They’re using really interesting words.

References


print: The role of captions as a supplemental literacy tool. *Journal of

language subtitles (SLS): Using subtitled
music video for reading growth. In G.
Siemens & C. Fulford, (Eds), *Proceedings of
World Conference on educational multi-media,
hypermnesta and telecommunications* (pp 3983–
3992), Chesapeake, Va: AACE. Retrieved
from: http://www.editlib.org/p/32055

model of school change for culturally and
linguistically diverse students in New
Zealand: A summary and evidence from
systematic replication. *Teaching Education*,
20(1), 1–21.

social, cultural and educational implications
and applications. Paper presented to
the Southland Technology (SOTEC)
Conference.

Parkhill, F., & Davey, R. (2012). We enjoyed it
and we learned at the same time! *Practically
Primary*, 17(2), 8–11.

unexpected breakthrough for Rapid Reading
Improvement: AVALIIL uses movies
to Read it–See it–Get it. *Set: Research
Information for Teachers*, 28–34.

Capturing literacy learning: Evaluating a
reading programme using popular novels
and films with subtitles. *Digital Culture
& Education*, 3(2), 140–156. URL: http://
www.digitalcultureandeducation.com/cms/
wp-content/uploads/2011/12/doc1053_
parkhill_2011.pdf

Parkhill, F. and Davey, R. (2014) I used to
read one page in two minutes and now
I am reading ten: Using popular film
subtitles to enhance literacy outcomes.
*Literacy Learning: the Middle Years* 22(2):
item/894.

Skinner, F.A., Kindermann, T.A., & Furrrer,
C.J. (2009). A motivational perspective
on engagement and disaffection:
Conceptualization and assessment of
children’s behavioral and emotional
participation in academic activities in the
classroom. *Educational and Psychological

Stanovich, K.E. (1986). Matthew effects in
reading: Some consequences of individual
differences in the acquisition of literacy.

Stanovich, K.E., & Cunningham, A.E.
(1993). Where does knowledge come
from? Specific associations between print
exposure and information acquisition.
*Journal of Educational Psychology*, 85,
211–229.

Van den Broek, P.W., Keene, P. &
during reading: Implications for the
use of multimedia to foster reading
comprehension. In A.G. Bus & S.B.
Neuman (Eds.), *Multimedia and literacy
development: Improving achievement for
young learners* (pp. 57–73). New York, NY:
Taylor & Francis.

Both Ronnie Davey and Faye Parkhill are
Senior Lecturers at the College of Education,
University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New
Zealand.

Sections of this report have been reprinted
with permission from TheAustralian Literacy
Educators’ Association (ALEA)

For a full version of this report refer to:
Parkhill, F. and Davey, R. (2014) I used to
read one page in two minutes and now
I am reading ten: Using popular film
subtitles to enhance literacy outcomes. *Literacy Learning: the Middle Years* 22(2):